



ÚNICA
INSTITUCIÓN UNIVERSITARIA
COLOMBO AMERICANA

WORKING PAPER

Teaching Lesson Planning to EFL Preservice Teachers: A Review of Studies

Docente:

Paola Ximena Romero Molina

Institución Universitaria Colombo Americana – ÚNICA
Programa de Licenciatura en Bilingüismo con Énfasis en Español e Inglés.

Reg. SNIES: 106242

Bogotá D.C. – Colombia, 2022

Vigilada MinEducación

Working Paper – Resultado de Investigación Grupo de Investigación Innovation on Bilingual Education - INNOBED Categoría B Colciencias

Dirección de Investigaciones

Calle 19 No. 2ª-49, Piso 3, Centro Colombo Americano

Teléfono: 2811777 Ext. 1291

dirinvestigacioneslic@unica.edu.co

www.unica.edu.co

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.26817/paper.19>

Prohibida la reproducción parcial o total de esta obra sin autorización de la
Institución Universitaria Colombo Americana – ÚNICA



Abstract

Preparing English as a Foreign Language (EFL) preservice teachers for lesson planning has been a concern among teacher educators globally. Research has shown that preservice teachers encounter difficulties in aspects such as objective setting, considering their learners' needs, and matching assessment and objectives, among others. Similarly, preservice teachers still need to be presented with ample opportunities for reflective teaching. These concerns have been addressed by teacher educators in systematic ways. Hence, guided by two sets of research questions, this literature review aims at exploring the procedures that educators in diverse contexts have used to aid their student teachers in preparing for lesson planning. The first set seeks to identify the procedures used as well as their outcomes. The second set of questions aims to inquire on the methodologies adopted. Twelve studies were selected for the final review, which were found using the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) and Google scholar databases as well as the academia.edu platform. A matrix was created to analyze the papers selected together with a coding process. The analysis revealed that collaborative procedures such as mentoring and lesson study combined with reflective teaching seem to render optimal learning experiences for preservice teachers. A special mention is given to plan lessons using authentic materials. Furthermore, types of methodologies that promote rich description such as case studies appear to be appropriate to frame these studies.

Keywords: lesson planning, EFL preservice teachers, collaborative teaching, reflective teaching, mentoring, authentic materials



Resumen

Preparar a los profesores en formación de inglés como lengua extranjera para planear sus lecciones ha sido una inquietud para los formadores de profesores a nivel global. Estudios han mostrado que los profesores en preparación encuentran dificultades para formular objetivos, considerar las necesidades de sus estudiantes, y alinear objetivos de aprendizaje con la evaluación entre otros temas. Asimismo, se hace necesario para los profesores en formación tener amplias oportunidades para reflexionar. Tales inquietudes han sido abordadas por los formadores de profesores de forma sistemática. Por lo cual, el propósito de la presente revisión de la literatura es explorar los procedimientos que los formadores de profesores, en diversos contextos, han creado para ayudar a sus pupilos a diseñar planes de clase. Esta revisión fue guiada por dos grupos de preguntas. El primer grupo indaga sobre los procedimientos usados y sus resultados, mientras que el segundo grupo pretende averiguar e identificar las metodologías adoptadas para aquellos estudios. Así, 12 estudios fueron seleccionados para la revisión final usando las bases de datos ERIC (Educational Resources Information Center, por su sigla en inglés), Google académico, y la plataforma academia.edu. Para esto se creó una matriz y, luego, los datos se analizaron siguiendo un proceso de creación de códigos. El análisis reveló que las estrategias colaborativas como mentoría y estudio de lección combinados con una enseñanza reflexiva parecen constituir experiencias óptimas de aprendizaje para los profesores en formación. De manera especial, se menciona el uso de materiales auténticos para crear planes de clase. De igual forma, las metodologías que promueven una descripción detallada tales como los estudios de caso sugieren ser las más apropiadas.

Palabras clave: planeación de clase, profesores en formación, inglés como lengua extranjera, enseñanza colaborativa, enseñanza reflexiva, mentoría, materiales auténticos



Teaching Lesson Planning to EFL Preservice Teachers: A Review of Studies

Lesson planning is part of the instructional skills that teachers in preparation need to have to be successful during their future professional practice. Extensively, studies have shown that it is not an easy task for preservice teachers to create well-designed lesson plans despite the theory they have studied in their teacher education courses. This planning process can be affected by aspects such as content knowledge, pedagogical knowledge, beliefs, attitudes, and experiences. Similarly, translating plans into action during lesson delivery constitutes an area of struggle for preservice teachers. In addition, being able to know how to plan with a certain kind of material (e.g., textbook, school manuals) doesn't guarantee that preservice teachers will transfer those skills to other types of resources such as authentic audio, video, or written texts.

The situation described above is commonplace in English Language Teaching around the globe. So it is at ÚNICA, an English teacher college in Bogotá-Colombia. Thus, a group of colleagues have identified the need to provide tools that help preservice teachers at this institution to develop or upgrade their lesson planning skills. In particular, these students could be provided with resources to use a kind of material that we have found highly valuable in teaching and learning, this is, audiovisual authentic materials. As a result, a colleague and myself have decided to undertake a project in which we aim to help prepare student teachers to create lesson plans using authentic materials in their practicum. To that purpose, it is necessary to give them some training sessions, mentor them, and analyze the results of such intervention. Such is the context for this literature review as it is crucial to research what have been explored in the area of lesson planning preparation for preservice teachers. It is also decisive to analyze if there exists any research that focuses specifically on preparing preservice teachers to design lesson plans based on authentic materials. Furthermore, inquiring into the methodology used in studies involving the



preparation of preservice teachers for lesson planning can guide our own inquiry in accurate ways. In brief, this paper aims at revising the literature concerning the preparation of preservice teachers for lesson planning, first to set the context for our research and discover gaps in previous ones, and second, set a synthesis of consultation for future researchers interested in similar studies.

Consequently, this literature review on preparing English as a Foreign Language (EFL) preservice teachers will be centered on topics that account for procedures in which teacher educators globally have attempted to aid their students develop their lesson planning skills. Some lines will be given to planning using authentic materials as it is a particular interest in writing this paper. In the same vein, I will present a special mention of the methodologies used in the papers reviewed. The concluding remarks will express how this review sets the context not only for the macro study mentioned earlier, but also for future studies related, particularly in the Colombian context. To start, the research questions and objectives are presented.

Research Questions

This literature was guided by the following research questions and objectives.

- 1a. What procedures are used to prepare pre-service teachers for lesson planning?
- 1b. What seem to be the most effective procedures?
- 1c. What is evidenced about preparing pre-service teachers for lesson planning using authentic materials?
- 2a. What research methodologies are salient in studies about preparing preservice teachers for lesson planning?
- 2b. What can be observed about the effectiveness of these methodologies?



Objectives

- 1a. Identify the procedures used with preservice teachers to prepare them for lesson planning.
- 1b. Determine the most effective procedures used to prepare teachers for lesson planning.
- 1c. Describe the findings evidenced about lesson planning using authentic materials.
- 2a. Identify the methodologies employed in studies about preparing preservice teachers for lesson planning.
- 2b. Describe the effectiveness of these methodologies

Methodology

This literature review is framed within a qualitative paradigm. To collect the data for this review, I searched papers in the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) and Google Scholar databases, as well as on the academia.edu platform. To find papers related to lesson planning and teacher preparation for preservice teachers I combined the following keywords: preparing lesson planning, EFL lesson planning, teacher education, preservice teachers, and preservice EFL teachers. I also searched information using the keywords lesson planning and authentic materials. For example, some combinations used were: preparing preservice teachers for lesson planning, preparing EFL preservice teachers for lesson planning, lesson planning and teacher education, lesson planning and preservice teachers, lesson planning and authentic materials. After the first search, 70 papers were found. On Google Scholar I preselected the articles using the star label feature and saved the articles in *my library* creating a code called: preservice teachers lesson planning. I then searched the two other platforms and preselected the articles. As I found a high quantity of articles about teachers' reflection, I only selected the ones that appeared to be about teaching how to lesson plan. I then revised the preselected articles to ensure that they were about preparing preservice EFL teachers for lesson planning. This preliminary selection was



done by reading the papers abstracts. If based on the abstract, the paper seemingly met the initial criterion (i.e., preparing teachers for lesson planning), the paper's information was saved in a matrix resulting in 48 articles.

After the preliminary selection, I decided to use an initial color coding technique, which I called the traffic light strategy. As a result, I read the abstract again and, if it directly related to the intended search, I gave the article green light. If the article was not directly related to my search (e.g., it was about teaching planning but not for EFL teachers), I gave it yellow light to visit it later and confirm. Finally, if the article was not related to the intended search (i.e., neither it was about EFL preservice teachers, nor was it about teaching lesson planning), I gave it red light. Essentially, this was a preliminary systematic color-coding technique to guarantee that the appropriate articles would be selected. Afterward, in the subsequent reading round, I considered the articles that were marked with the yellow light to read the introduction, findings and conclusions to determine if they were related to the intended search. Some of them were discarded for this review. For example, Díaz Larenas et al. (2016) is a study about lesson planning with preservice teachers, but it is a diagnosis of the main areas of difficulty rather than an analysis of a procedure used to help teachers plan (see inclusion and exclusion criteria). Yet other articles were found directly related and included in the definite selection such as Chien (2016). Finally, upon the initial coding analysis based on abstract, or abstract, introduction and findings reading, 12 articles were included based on the criteria explained below, which were published from 2010 onwards.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria

To be included in this review papers required to meet the following criteria. First, they needed to be about EFL preservice teachers, or both preservice and in service teachers (e.g., Liyanage & Bartlett, 2010). Second, a procedure to teach preservice teachers how to plan was implemented and described in the study. Papers were excluded when they did not comply with all the inclusion criteria. For instance, the participants were preservice



teachers, but not EFL preservice teachers. The difficulties of preservice teachers when lesson planning were diagnosed, but no intervention was effected. Conversely, one article is not a research report and it was not published after 2010 (Oguz & Bahar, 2008), yet it was included because it deals with a topic of interest for this research, namely, authentic materials.

Some articles are worth a special mention at this point. These papers were not included on the list of 12, yet they support the findings as to what happens with preservice teachers in other areas. One is a recent quantitative meta-analysis (Mok & Staub, 2021) based on papers that report experiences of coaching, mentoring and supervising, and the other one is a mixed-method study about a mentoring experience with preservice teachers. (Gómez Johnson et al., 2020). Finally, this literature review is not intended to be an exhaustive review of works, rather, it aims at providing a solid basis to frame a study about teaching lesson planning skills with authentic materials. Similarly, to the best of my knowledge, I didn't find enough articles to write a review solely based on the Colombian context, which is why this paper is based on articles written in various countries. It is as well expected that this review will provide a point of reference for other novice and experienced researchers interested in related future studies.

Data Analysis

The studies that will be presented here are the result of the process described above. Similarly, to further reinforce the analysis, a coding process was followed to identify themes. This process involved six steps for coding: Preparing and organizing the data, exploring and coding the data, coding to build description and themes, representing and reporting qualitative findings, interpreting the findings, and validating the accuracy of the findings (Creswell, 2002). See Appendix for an example of the coding process. Hence, when reviewing the studies about preparing EFL preservice teachers for lesson planning, five main themes emerged: *providing models for reflection on teachers' knowledge and beliefs,*



mentoring and supervision, collaborative approaches, first lesson planning experiences, and using authentic materials.

Providing Models for Reflection on Teachers' Knowledge and Beliefs

The first group of studies (i.e., Drajadi et al., 2021; Liyanage and Bartlett, 2010; Telles-Quesada et al., 2019) illustrates how, after identifying a practical need set by the particular teaching contexts (e.g., curricular, pedagogical), the teacher educators attempted to help their student teachers by creating a systematic means. Thus, they produced a strategy that students could follow, be it related to cognition and knowledge, metacognition or both. They also proposed a mechanism for students to think and reflect guided by what was revealed in the lesson plans in the light of the strategy, the feedback given by their instructors, and the discussions held. This evidences what has been recommended in previous studies to treat teacher's instructional skills, pedagogical and content knowledge as well as beliefs and attitudes.

Mentoring and Supervision

Amalia and Imperiani (2013) as well as Jantarach and Soontornwipast (2018) framed their studies within the courses offered at their two respective universities either as instructional or practicum courses. Unlike the studies mentioned above, the educators in these courses did not design an additional intervention, rather, they benefited from their courses to be systematic about their mentoring and supervising roles. They set an atmosphere in which students could express their ideas. This may be challenging given the despair relationships that mentors or supervisors have with their students. Yet this challenge seems to have been overcome by these two groups of preservice teachers and educators.

Collaborative Approaches

Collaborative lesson planning and the Japanese strategy of lesson study also constitute some procedures used by educators to facilitate lesson planning and the improvement of



lesson planning skills (Badawi, 2017; Coskun, 2019). The key of these procedures, as exemplified by these two studies, is collaboration between classmates and between the educators and the student teachers. The participants in these studies were enrolled in the last two years or last year of their studies.

First lesson planning experiences

Two features can be highlighted from the next group of studies (see Chien (2016; Cuñado & Abocejo, 2019; Gülten, 2013). First, these are first experiences of lesson planning in which the focus was solely on lesson plan design, that is, these lesson plans were not implemented. Contrary to the students in the collaborative studies, these were student teachers at early stages of their studies. The second feature is the strategy used, which is providing student teachers with sample of lesson plans or ideas in surveys and guiding them to create their own. These studies underscore the importance of providing preservice teachers with samples and models from early stages in their studies.

Using authentic materials

Jaelani and Umam (2021) together with Oguz and Bahar (2008) are two studies which had been separated from the others for a reason that directly concerns the interests of this paper, that is, the combination of preparing teachers for lesson planning with the use of authentic materials. The former (Jaelani & Umam, 2021) describes an experience to expose preservice teachers to the use of authentic materials for their learning, in other words, the researchers are modeling a pedagogical strategy. In a way, their research illustrates the point that the authors of the second study (Oguz & Bahar, 2008) were trying to make: creating environments in which preservice teachers can construct their learning by being exposed and experimenting with the ways of teaching that they will face in their professional future lives.



Findings and Discussion

Upon the preliminary analysis, the themes shown above emerged, which were the result of a first exploration guided by the questions and objectives set for this review. The first set of questions aim to inquire into the procedures used to teach lesson planning and their effectiveness (1a. What procedures are used to prepare pre-service teachers for lesson planning? 1b. What seem to be the most effective procedures? 1c. What is evidenced about preparing pre-service teachers for lesson planning using authentic materials?)

The results evidence five main ways to guide preservice teachers to develop or upgrade their lesson planning skills, which eventually should be transferred into a successful lesson delivery. These themes found represent the models, stages, and techniques that teacher educators have proposed to help their student teachers. Even though the models or techniques implemented were so varied (e.g., Chien's iceberg metaphor model (2016); Liyanage and Bartlett's metacognitive model (2010); Telles Quesada et al.'s points of improvement (2019)), the common shared feature of these procedures is that they were used in systematic ways, aimed at constructing knowledge in a specific setting, which transformed them into solid strategies rather than just techniques.

The uniqueness and context of each study can be briefly appreciated in the description presented for each of the cases (see Appendix B for a summary of each study). Consequently, it can be observed that the studies were conducted in diverse settings (Egypt, Turkey, The Philippines, Taiwan, Chile, to name a few), and with participants of various characteristics (second year students versus fourth year). This emphasizes the contextual and situated nature of each learning setting. Yet various points of convergence among these studies are worth the mention in these lines. Firstly, they constituted a diagnosis and response to an informed need (e.g., Amalia & Imperiani, 2013; Jaelani & Umam, 2021; Telles Quesada, 2019). In some cases, educators have noticed their student teachers' needs concerning objectives setting, alignment between objectives and assessment, or selecting



appropriate activities. In all these preservice-teaching settings, educators seemed to show a genuine interest in helping their students work on knowledge construction as well as on reflective teaching, which is coherent with needs identified before (Vélez-Rendón, 2002).

Secondly, educators have responded with a carefully planned type of intervention. For example, they have proposed a model (iceberg, points of improvement, lesson study, etc.) or a type of implicit guidance through artifacts such as information on surveys or lesson plan samples (Cuñado & Abocejo, 2019; Gülten, 2013). These interventions underscore the need to work on content and pedagogical knowledge. Nonetheless, preservice teachers' educators have as well used instruments to promote reflection and dialogical practices. This works in accordance with what previous studies have revealed about the need to work on cognitive aspects as well as beliefs, attitudes, and experiences (Fandiño, 2013).

Furthermore, all studies are rigorous in designing and analyzing instruments, some with a higher level of detail (e.g., Badawi, 2017; Drajadi et al., 2021). This level of detail helps understanding the phenomenon in a deeper way, so this is a recommendation for future studies, that is, including or explaining the rubric used for lesson planning skills checking. Despite the fact that reflective instruments and discussion have been part of these studies, they do not report much on the challenge that the disparity in power relationships between educators and preservice teachers may cause during the reflective discussion. Even though one study mentioned that student teachers changed a belief about discussing their decisions (Amalia & Imperiani, 2013), sometimes students leave to their own discretion whether or not to adjust their plans based on the instructor's feedback (Jantarach & Soontornwipast, 2018). Hence, reporting more insights into this situation is another suggestion for future research.

All the studies in the sample considered for this review seem to underscore the collaborative and modelling aspects of preparing preservice teachers. Collaboration and mentoring are key to facilitate that scaffolding that student teachers require to



face the current challenges posed by their studies as well as those that they will face in their professional future lives. This is coherent with what has been observed in some recent studies with preservice teachers in other education areas. To illustrate, Mok and Staub (2021) reported a meta-analysis on the effectiveness of mentoring, coaching, and supervising. They found that mentoring, accompanied by cognitive modelling, was the most effective procedure to help preservice teachers develop lesson planning and instructional skills. Similarly, Gomez Johnson et al. (2020), reported a mixed-method study in which they found that mentoring helped beginning preservice teachers increase their self-efficacy, which resulted in better lesson planning skills.

To conclude the answers to the first group of research questions, I found it convenient, for the purpose of this literature review, to devote some lines to the studies about the use of authentic materials to prepare preservice teachers for lesson planning. To begin, studies of the type are scarce. To the best of my knowledge, only two studies were found. The first is a research report of an exposure to experiencing and planning with these kinds of materials (Jaelani & Umam, 2021; see study 11 in Appendix B). In the same vein, Oguz and Bahar (2008) solidly supported the need to expose student teachers to prepare lesson plans using authentic materials based on a constructivist perspective. They argued that knowledge needed to be constructed because solely knowing the theory did not guarantee that the preservice teachers would automatically transfer their knowledge to another setting or to using a different type of material. Also these researchers noted that "If the prospective foreign language teachers are educated in authentic learning environments with authentic materials, it becomes more probable that they create such environments and use that kind of materials when they start teaching" p. 335). This statement supports the need we have found to research how to prepare preservice teachers for lesson planning using authentic materials, which is the macro frame for the present literature review.



A word on the methodology used

Having reported the findings concerning the first group of questions, this section will account for some findings as for the methodology used in the studies considered (i.e., 2a. What research methodologies are salient in studies about preparing preservice teachers for lesson planning? 2b. What can be observed about the effectiveness of these methodologies?)

Table 1

Methodology used in the studies

Study	Methodology	Instruments used for data collection
Study 1. Drajati et al. (2021)	Qualitative: Case study	- Rubric for lesson plans - Reflective journals - Interview
Study 2. Liyanage and Bartlett (2010)	Qualitative: Grounded Method	- Interview (stimulated recall with prompts)
Study 3. Telles-Quesada et al. (2019)	Qualitative: Action Research	- Questionnaires for reflection - Focus group
Study 4. Amalia and Imperiani (2013)	Qualitative: Action Research	- Lesson plans - Questionnaires - Interviews for reflection
Study 5. Jantarach and Soontornwipast (2018)	Qualitative: Grounded theory	- (Semi-structured) interviews: before and after lesson implementation - video recordings of lessons



Study 6. Coskun (2019)	Qualitative: doesn't specify (it could be either a case study or action research)	- Focus group: pre- and post- lesson implementation -Survey for reflection
Study 7. Badawi (2017)	Quantitative: experimental study	- Pre and post treatment lesson plan quality checklist - pre and post treatment observation checklist
Study 8. Gülten (2013)	Qualitative: doesn't specify (it could be either a case study or action research)	-Lesson plans - Questionnaires for reflection
Study 9. Chien (2016)	Qualitative: Case study	-lesson plans - Lesson plan feedback - Questionnaire for reflection
Study 10. Cuñado and Abocejo (2019)	Descriptive survey research	- Surveys about lesson plan competencies and reflections
Study 11. Jaelani and Umam (2021)	Qualitative: Case study	- Questionnaire for reflection - Interviews
Study 12. Oguz and Bahar (2008)	Literature review	

The methodology of these studies revealed that most researchers selected a qualitative type of research. The most salient design is that of case study followed by action research, which reinforces the purpose to contextualize the practices described. As well, these



studies are highly descriptive, which is coherent with using a case study design as this is a type of ethnography (Creswell, 2012). Similarly, action research studies display a notorious level of description. In consequence, various instruments are employed to depict the phenomenon taking place such as journals, or video recordings for observation. In fact, observation was the technique used in the majority of cases, even though not all of them specify by which means. An additional feature that enriches the description of the context is the use of questionnaires. Such procedure constitutes as well a technique to ensure the validity of the data, that means, obtaining data from a wide range of sources. A final point to notice is the use of interviews for reflection. In brief, the methodology adopted by the studies considered facilitated the twofold aim of helping preservice teachers develop lesson planning and instructional skills as well as promoting reflective teaching.

Conclusion

Lesson planning and instructional skills are essential in EFL teacher education processes. So are reflective opportunities for EFL preservice teachers. Preparing them is a need that has been addressed by teacher educators in strategic procedures based on well-planned research. Research studies suggest that collaborative approaches for teaching lesson planning together with opportunities for reflection constitute the core strategies to facilitate the development of lesson planning skills. The methodologies that foster rich description and reflection followed for such studies align with the objective of promoting contextualized practices. As a result, this review of studies could be used for novice and experienced researchers interested in exploring how to approach lesson planning teaching to have a guiding point of departure and enrich the findings presented. Such enrichment may be fostered by, for example, inquiring on how the power relationship between supervisors or mentors and preservice teachers affect the outcomes of feedback adjustments and reflections. Situated practices of preservice teachers planning with specific technological tools and materials is another area that could be further researched



using a type of methodology and design such as the ones described here. Clearly, the need to continue to explore lesson planning with authentic materials has been evidenced by the scarcity of studies of the type.

References

- Amalia, L. L., & Imperiani, E. D. (2013). Mentor coaching to help preservice teachers in designing an effective lesson plan. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 2(2), 275-280.
- Badawi, M. F. A. (2017). Using Collaborative Lesson-Preparation for Developing EFL Prospective Teachers' Lesson Plan Quality and Pedagogical Performance *عربية دراسات* 87(2), 451-480. https://saep.journals.ekb.eg/article_56401.html
- Chien, C. W. (2016). Pre-service teachers' knowledge construction in English lesson plan designs. *International Journal of Teaching and Case Studies*, 7(1), 24-41. <https://www.inderscienceonline.com/doi/abs/10.1504/IJTCS.2016.076039>
- Coskun, A. (2019). An Exploration of Lesson Study for Pre-Service English as a Foreign Language Teacher Education. *i-Manager's Journal on School Educational Technology*, 15(2), 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.26634/jsch.15.2.16541>
- Creswell, J. W. (2002). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Cuñado, A. G., & Abocejo, F. T. (2019). Lesson planning competency of English major university sophomore students. *European Journal of Education Studies* 5(8), 395-408. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.2538422>



Díaz Larenas, C. H., Ruiz-Tagle, D., Tagle Ochoa, T., & Alarcón Hernández, P. (2016). Lesson planning and classroom performance on English teaching preservice teachers: a preliminary scanner in three Chilean universities. *Revista Internacional de Investigación en Ciencias Sociales*, 12(1), 15-28. <https://doi.org/10.18004/riics.2016.julio.15-28>.

Drajati, N. A., Rakerda, H., Sulistyawati, H., & Nurkamto, J. (2021). Investigating the adoption of TPACK-21CL by English pre-service teachers in a COVID-19 teaching practicum. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 11(1), 124-133. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v11i1.34625>

Fandiño, Y. (2013). Knowledge base and EFL teacher education programs: A Colombian perspective. *Íkala, Revista de Lenguaje y Cultura*, 18(1), 83-95.

Gomez Johnson, K. M., Schaffer, C. L., Nix, L. E., & Hayden, H. E. (2020). Learning to Lesson Plan: A Mentor's Impact on Pre-service Teachers. *The Nebraska Educator: A student-led Journal* 5, 1-30. <https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/nebeducator/49>

Gülten, A. Z. (2013). Am I planning well? Teacher trainees' voices on lesson planning. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 93, 1409-1413. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.053>

Jaelani, A., & Umam, A. (2021). Preparing EFL pre-service teachers for curriculum 2013 through authentic materials and assessment integration. *JEES (Journal of English Educators Society)*, 6(1), 171-177. <http://doi.org/10.21070/jees.v6i1.829>

Jantarach, V., & Soontornwipast, K. (2018). EFL Student Teachers' Lesson Planning Processes: A Grounded Theory Study. *Arab World English Journal* 9(3), 311-330. <https://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol9no3.21>



Liyanage, I., & Bartlett, B. J. (2010). From autopsy to biopsy: A metacognitive view of lesson planning and teacher trainees in ELT. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 26*(7), 1362-1371. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2010.03.006>

Mok, S. Y., & Staub, F. C. (2021). Does coaching, mentoring, and supervision matter for pre-service teachers' planning skills and clarity of instruction? A meta-analysis of (quasi-)experimental studies. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 107*, 103484, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103484>

Oguz, A., & Bahar, H. O. (2008). The importance of using authentic materials in prospective foreign language teacher training. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences, 5*(4), 328-336.

Telles Quezada, N., Inostroza Araos, M. J., & Rosas-Maldonado, M. (2019). Points of Improvement: Reflective Strategy to Support Chilean EFL Pre-Service Teachers' Lesson Planning. *How, 26*(2), 88-105. <https://doi.org/10.19183/how.26.2.498>

Vélez-Rendón, G. (2002). Second language teacher education: A review of the literature. *Foreign language annals, 35*(4), 457-467.



Appendix B

Summary of Articles in the Corpus Classified by Categories

Providing Models for Reflection on Teachers' Knowledge and Beliefs

Study 1. The first study is that by Drajadi et al. (2021) who aimed at researching the use of what they called Technological Pedagogical and Content Knowledge 21 Century Learning framework (TPACK-21 CL). This research adopted a case study methodology in which the lesson plans of 20 preservice English teachers were analyzed using a rubric based on the TPACK-21 CL. The preservice teachers participated voluntarily in the study which was framed within a sixteen-week practicum course. Together with the rubric, the researchers used reflective journals kept by the students and in-depth interview to collect reflective data. Three themes guided the analysis of the reflection instruments: learning values, challenges faced during planning, and solutions (p. 127). Results showed that preservice teachers displayed diverse degrees of understanding of planning and they benefited from planning following a TPACK-21 CL framework.

Study 2. Liyanage and Bartlett (2010) conducted a study to see the results of using a framework based on metacognitive strategies (MSF) to help preservice teachers plan their lessons in a more critical way. The researchers created a model including the essential strategies of planning, monitoring and evaluating and applied them to lesson plan design. The framework was implemented with nine graduate students taking a course in a graduate program in Australia. The technique used to elicit responses associated with the content of their lesson plan was stimulated recall (interviewees answer after being prompted on a point of interest). The data were analyzed inductively through a grounded method in which the three categories found emerged from the answers collected. Such themes were: *self awareness*, which referred to appraising what they did before, and what they were doing now and how the MSF had influenced them to adjust; *knowledge*, which related to



understanding how to plan, especially thinking of their students as proposed by the MSF; *positioning*, which was reflecting on what they knew and valued before, and what they were still learning and assessing as caused by using the MSF (p.1368).

Study 3. Telles-Quesada et al., (2019) also undertook a study with 11 Chilean preservice teachers to help them plan communicative lessons. The authors contextualized the study by describing that even though the Chilean curriculum proposed a communicative approach for English Language Teaching (ELT), a considerable number of students in Chilean universities still struggled to plan and deliver lessons with communicative [features](#). At facing this problem, the main researcher decided to create a strategy to help preservice teachers in her university. In consequence, she designed a proposal combining a tool for reflection and a strategy called *points for improvement* (p. 95). To collect data, the researchers used a questionnaire to explore the participants' beliefs regarding the process of planning and communicative language teaching. They also used a focus group which occurred at the end of the reflection to identify which points of improvement had emerged and how these helped to adjust the lesson plans. Data were analyzed by means of thematic analysis. The results revealed that the group of preservice teachers became more aware of their decisions and reflected on their beliefs. As well, they identified points of improvement which later helped them design their lessons in a more communicative way.

Mentoring and Supervision

Study 4. In their study, Amalia & Imperiani (2013) researched how mentoring helped preservice teachers work on their lesson planning skills. For that purpose, the researchers implemented action research with a group of six preservice teachers in the seventh semester of their studies in an Indonesian university. The implementation took part during an instructional course at their university. The group of students designed a lesson plan and then received feedback from their mentors. Upon feedback they made adjustments as they considered. They answered a questionnaire, and then an interview to express their



perceptions of the process. The results showed that the preservice teachers found mentoring beneficial. Also, they expressed that they changed a belief about the difficulty to discuss their decisions for lesson planning, so through this intervention they felt more comfortable with their mentors to share the decisions they had made while planning.

Study 5. Jantarach & Soontornwipast (2018) is a study about the lesson planning process of 22 fifth-semester preservice teachers at a Thai university. By means of semi-structured interviews (before and after implementing a plan), and observations (of plan implementations), the researchers produced a detailed account of the phases of planning this group of preservice teachers went through and how various factors encountered at each of these phases influenced the lesson planning decisions as well as actions taken by this group of student teachers. Thus, they created some grounded theory by analyzing the data collected from the instruments used.

Collaborative Approaches

Study 6. Coskun's (2019) is a study based on a lesson study experience in Turkey which involved three preservice teachers, one expert teacher, a school mentor, and a group of seven students who were taught the lessons. During the process, the preservice teacher triad and the expert teacher planned the lesson together. Then, after the expert teacher taught it, all five participants discussed and established what could be done differently the following time the lesson was taught. Another round of discussion was held after one of the preservice teachers delivered the lesson for the second time with the adjustments identified. The instruments used for data collection were a focus-group interview administered at the post-lesson meetings. Then, a survey with open questions was used to know the insights of the mentor and the preservice teachers at the end of the lesson-study intervention.



Study 7. In this research, Badawi (2017) studied the effect of collaborative-lesson preparation among a group of 42 fourth-year English majors at an Egyptian university. After diagnosing some difficulties of preservice teachers, the researcher attempted to propose a means to help students develop better planning skills. Consequently, the students from the practicum course were selected to implement the study. The group was divided into two groups: control and experimental. The treatment consisted of ten lessons taught during a month, which were designed to help students plan collaboratively by creating their lesson plans and discussing them with classmates guided by the modules taught. The control group didn't receive the special month training on collaborative lesson planning. Descriptive statistics and statistical analysis were used to analyze the data, which showed that there was statistical difference between the lesson plans and lesson delivery of students in the experimental group before and after the treatment. This proved that collaborative planning was effective. This study provided a detailed account of the intervention process and the instruments used, and it showed a rigorous step by step process. Unlike other studies, it didn't employ any qualitative instruments to collect students' reflections.

First lesson planning experiences

Study 8. Gülten (2013) studied 150 student teachers of fourth semester in a teaching methodology course who had an initial experience with lesson planning in a Turkish university. Thus, after been given some instruction as part of the course topics related to lesson planning, the group of preservice teachers analyzed some samples of lesson plans and then created their own. The plans were analyzed by taking into account two main aspects: objective setting and an activity proposed by the student-teachers for the final stage of a reading lesson. Also, a questionnaire with open ended questions was used to obtain data about the students' perception of that first planning experience. The lesson plan analysis showed that over half of the participants succeeded in setting objectives (59%), but most of them encountered difficulties to include an appropriate activity for the



post stage of the reading lesson (75%). The questionnaire showed that students valued having a genuine teaching experience.

Study 9. Chien (2016) carried out a study with 52 students in Taiwan. This group of students created lesson plans cooperatively to teach a group of EFL children (the lessons designed were not delivered). To prepare the students for that lesson plan creation, the course educator presented them with a lesson plan sample. Also, she used Malderez's and Bodoczky's iceberg model (1999, as cited in Chien, 2016) to analyze how these preservice teachers built what they knew about teaching. The lesson plans produced were revised by the course teacher and the student teachers were given feedback. Afterwards, the student teachers answered a questionnaire intended to explore their experience both while planning and upon receiving feedback. Results showed that guiding preservice teachers based on the model was useful for them to build their knowledge of content, language and pedagogy.

Study 10. In this study, Cuñado and Abocejo (2019) conducted research to unveil the lesson planning competencies of 219 second year students in a university in the Philippines. By means of survey analysis, they found that preservice teachers had the potential to create lesson plans that covered the main aspects required, yet they also encountered some difficulties. The surveys exposed students with ideas that could help them plan in a more efficient way. This study was essentially diagnostic as, apart from being exposed to the information in the surveys, the preservice teachers did not receive any type of instruction or coaching approach.

Using authentic materials

Study 11. Jaelani and Umam (2021) made the case of using authentic materials and authentic assessment with service teachers to expose them and prepare them as future professionals to use these kinds of materials. The researchers implemented this project



because the Indonesian Curriculum (i.e., curriculum 2013) requires teachers to use authentic materials and authentic assessment. Consequently, these researchers followed an action research design to have 11 fourth-semester student teachers experience with authentic materials and authentic assessments. The instruments used for data collection were employed based on each stage of the study cycle. Thus, at the planning stage the researchers found documents to inform their decisions; during action, they implemented their plan; at the observation stage, they observed and collected data (the observation means is not specified); finally, for reflection, they administered a questionnaire to inquire on students' opinions. The main point these researchers aimed at illustrating was the need to expose preservice teachers to the kinds of materials and practice that they would encounter in their future practice. In other words, though it was not stated explicitly by the researchers, they were modelling a kind of procedure for their students.

Study 12. Oguz and Bahar (2008) made the case for using authentic materials within a constructivist approach to prepare pre-service teachers for their future practice. They argued that following such approach immerses student teachers in an environment in which they are not only told how instructional decisions should be made, but also they get to make decisions by themselves. Besides they pointed out that authentic materials together with authentic tasks have proved effective for teaching based on a literature review. The combination of a constructivist perspective and an authentic learning setting enables prospective teachers to be prepared to replicate this model in their future experiences. Yet it is not enough to teach this solely as a form on content delivery. On the contrary, teacher educators, as Oguz and Bahar (2008) recommended, need to provide preservice teachers with a model of how to use authentic materials "If the prospective foreign language teachers are educated in authentic learning environments with authentic materials, it becomes more probable that they create such environments and use that kind of materials when they start teaching" p. 335).





ÚNICA

INSTITUCIÓN UNIVERSITARIA
COLOMBO AMERICANA

Calle 19 N. 2A - 49, edificio Centro Colombo Americano, tercer piso

Tel.: (+57-1) 281 1777 -  (+57) 314 419 6996

E-mail: info@unica.edu.co

Bogotá D.C., Colombia

www.unica.edu.co